



Verbal Comments by Lynn Tuttle at U.S. Department of Education ESSA Public Input Meeting – January 11, 2016

Good morning. My name is Lynn Tuttle, and it is my honor to serve as the Senior Regulatory Policy Advisor for the National Association for Music Education. Representing 68,000 members bringing music education to our nation's students and schools, we, along with our coalition members in the Music Education Policy Roundtable believe that **all students should have access to high quality music education.**

Unfortunately, research from the University of Indianaⁱ indicates that elementary students from urban settings, from rural areas, from low income households and students of color do not share the same access to high quality music education as their white, suburban counterparts. We are excited about the potential of the Every Student Succeeds Act to help right this wrong by providing supplemental support to increase access to music education for all children.

We respectfully ask that the U.S. Department of Education consider the following requests as you provide non-regulatory guidance and reporting requirements for Title IA in support of high quality education, including music education, for all:

1. Require disaggregated data for all Well-Rounded subject educators teaching outside of their credentialed teaching areas, including music educators. (Sections 1005 and 1111). We have anecdotal stories from our colleagues that they are being asked to teach reading and math; having the data to confirm this information would be extremely useful for the field.
2. Encourage states to include access to music education as an “other indicator determined by the State” in the new state-level accountability formulas (Section 1005). New Jersey, utilizing data from its State Longitudinal Data Systemⁱⁱ, currently includes access to music and arts education as part of its school report card system. Such information helps advocates, philanthropists, and community leaders understand where additional resources may be needed to create better access to music and arts education within their state. The information on statewide access to music and the arts often exists, just not in an accessible format for parents, policymakers, researchers, and advocates to use.
3. Include examples of how music and arts programs can be utilized to help children meet challenging State academic standards as part of Title I Targeted Assistance Programs (Section 1009). While states such as Californiaⁱⁱⁱ and Arizona^{iv} have supported arts integration and arts education as part of the whole school reform models of Title I Schoolwide programs, there are fewer models utilizing Targeted Assistance funds in support of a Well-Rounded Education. Providing examples in the areas of music and the arts would clarify what this could look like for Title I targeted schools. And
4. Include examples of how music and the arts support and contribute to parental and family engagement (Section 1010). Dr. Joyce Epstein recognizes audience participation at student music concerts as one of the ways in which parents successfully connect with their schools^v. Making this connection between concert participation, music education, and family engagement would help call out how music and the arts contribute to a school's culture and climate.

In addition, please consider the following requests as the Department of Education provides non-regulatory guidance and reporting requirements for Titles II and IV:

1. Provide clarity that as part of allowable state activities for mentoring new teachers, Title IIA funds may be used for teachers of well-rounded subjects, including music and the arts (Section 2101). Teacher retention is an issue for music and arts educators, but often mentoring programs do not include “specials” teachers. Clarity about the availability of these funds for all teachers, including music and the arts, would help reduce this discrepancy.
2. Require that reporting on state and local activities in support of a well-rounded education under Title IV be reported out by subject area, including music education (Sections 4104 and 4106). Our Association is working diligently to help music educators understand the opportunities available under Title IV to provide supplemental support for music education. Annual reporting by districts (and states) will help all of us learn where Title IV funds are helping increase access to music education.
3. Clarify that after-school programs supported by 21st Century Community Learning Center funding are not meant to replace existing in-school music and arts programs and include examples of how music and the arts can be offered in supplemental after-school programs supported with these funds (Section 4201).^{vi}
4. Finally, require that Charter School Expansion Grants include all definitions and requirements for a well-rounded education, including offering music and the arts (Section 4301). Arts Education Census data from Arizona show that access to music education is least available for students in very small, rural schools, and for students in charter schools^{vii}. We believe all students should have access to music education regardless of the kind of school they attend, and we ask that the Department consider well-rounded education requirements in support of access for all in the charter school grant program.

Thank you for the opportunity to bring these suggestions to your attention. Of all the issues we fight for as an association of music educators, access to music education for all of our nation’s students – students in rural classrooms, students in inner cities, students from diverse backgrounds, students from homes in poverty – is by the far the most important. As states transition to the new flexibility in allocating resources, particularly for low performing schools, we urge the US Department of Education to issue uniform implementation guidance that explicitly affirms eligibility for music and the arts under Title I, as well as the opportunities available under Titles II and IV. We are excited about the possibility ESSA provides in making certain every American child can share in the joy of making music during the school day.

1. Classroom Music Experiences of U.S. Elementary School Children: An Analysis of the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study of 1998–1999. Peter Miksza and Brent M. Gault. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, April 2014; vol. 62, 1: pp. 4–17., first published on March 5, 2014

The primary purpose of this study was to describe the music experiences elementary school children in the United States receive in the academic classroom setting. The data were drawn from the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study of the Kindergarten Class of 1998–1999 (ECLS–K), a nationally representative study that followed kindergarteners through to their eighth–grade school year with the last data collection wave in 2006–2007. The variables pertaining to music experiences in the academic classroom that were available in the ECLS–K were (a) the frequency and duration with which children received music instruction, (b) the frequency that music was used to teach math, and (c) the percentage of children receiving formal music instruction outside of school. Each of these variables also was analyzed as a function of child urbanicity, socioeconomic status (SES), and race. Statistically significant ($p < .001$) disparities among children based on urbanicity, SES, and race were found on each of the music experience variables. Overall, White suburban students of high levels of SES tended to receive significantly more music experiences than students of color from urban and rural settings and of low SES. The findings support the need to advocate for high–quality music programs for all students and particularly for those from traditionally underserved populations.

ii <http://artsednj.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/First-in-the-Nation-Arts-Education-Included-in-the-Just-Released-New-Jersey-School-Performance-Reports-.pdf>
<http://www.state.nj.us/education/pr/1314/35/355550050.pdf>

Example for Watchung Hills High School, Somerset County, New Jersey showing both access to music and arts education in this New Jersey school, as well as student participation rates.

iii www.Title1arts.org

iv <http://www.arizonatitle1arts.org/>

v http://www.csos.jhu.edu/P2000/nnps_model/school/sixtypes/type3.htm

vi <http://wesdschools.org/Page/71>

vii <http://azarts.gov/resources/arizona-arts-education-research-institute/>